

# Logic and Language

## Internalism and Externalism

Is there any sense according to which Oscar and Twin-Oscar mean the same thing when they say "Water is liquid"?

## Essential Reading

- Putnam, Hilary, "The Meaning of 'Meaning'", in his *Mind, Language and Reality*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (1975), ch. 12
- Burge, Tyler, "Individualism and the Mental", *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, vol. 4 (1979), pp. 73-122
- Boghossian, Paul "The Transparency of Mental Content", *Philosophical Perspectives*, vol. 8 (1994), pp. 33-50
- Segal, Gabriel, *A Slim Book about Narrow Content*, Cambridge, MA: MIT Press (2000)

## Additional Reading

- Kripke, Saul, "A Puzzle About Belief", in A. Margalit (ed.), *Meaning and Use*, Dordrecht: Reidel (1979), pp. 239-83
- Burge, Tyler, "Individualism and Psychology", *The Philosophical Review*, vol. 95 (1986), pp. 3-45
- Boghossian, Paul "What the Externalist Can Know *A Priori*", *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, New Series, vol. 97 (1997), pp. 161-75

## Past Paper Questions

- 2008, Q2: "Meanings ain't just in the head." (PUTNAM) Are there good reasons to think that this claim is true?
- 2009, Q20: What role does the external environment play in determining the meanings of our words?
- 2010, Q2: "If meaning were determined by features of the natural or social environment that ordinary speakers need know nothing about, it would follow that ordinary speakers may not know what their words mean. But speakers cannot fail to know the meanings of their words. So externalism about meaning is false." Discuss.
- 2011, Q10: Does your twin-earth counterpart use "water" with the same meaning as you?
- 2012, Q8: "Competent speakers know by reflection what their words mean. Certain words have their meaning because of speaker interaction with the environment. Thus, competent speakers can know by reflection about such interaction with the environment." Discuss.
- 2013, Q2: When you and your counterpart on twin earth use the word "water", you refer to different chemical substances. Is there any good sense in which you use it with the same meaning?
- 2014, Q12: Is there any sense according to which Oscar and Twin-Oscar mean the same thing when they say "Water is liquid"?